



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

November 21, 2003

Ms. Elena N. Cablao  
Assistant General Counsel  
Texas Workers' Compensation Commission  
4000 South IH-35, MS-4D  
Austin, Texas 78704

OR2003-8398

Dear Ms. Cablao:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 191443.

The Texas Workers' Compensation Commission (the "commission") received a request for nine categories of information regarding claim information pertaining to six named individuals. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>1</sup>

Section 552.103 of the Government Code provides as follows:

- (a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person's office or employment, is or may be a party.

---

<sup>1</sup>We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

....

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

The governmental body has the burden of providing relevant facts and documents to show that the section 552.103(a) exception is applicable in a particular situation. The test for meeting this burden is a showing that (1) litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the governmental body receives the request for information, and (2) the information at issue is related to that litigation. *University of Tex. Law Sch. v. Texas Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479, 481 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, no pet.); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d 210, 212 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref'd n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990). The governmental body must meet both prongs of this test for information to be excepted under 552.103(a).

You indicate that the commission is currently involved in a lawsuit and have submitted to this office the plaintiff's original petition in Cause No. GN302325, *ACE Insurance Company of Texas v. Garcia*, filed in the 98<sup>th</sup> District Court of Travis County. We find that the commission was a party to this case prior to the date that it received the instant request for information. Having reviewed the submitted documents, we conclude that they are related to the pending litigation for the purposes of section 552.103(a). Therefore, the commission may withhold most of the information at issue under section 552.103.

We note, however, that generally, once information has been obtained by all parties to the litigation through discovery or otherwise, no section 552.103(a) interest exists with respect to that information. Open Records Decision Nos. 349 (1982), 320 (1982). Thus, information that has either been obtained from or provided to the opposing party is not excepted from disclosure under section 552.103(a). We note that portions of the submitted information have been obtained by the opposing party in this matter. Accordingly, we conclude that the commission may not withhold this particular information under section 552.103. Further, the applicability of section 552.103(a) ends once the litigation has been concluded. Attorney General Opinion MW-575 (1982); Open Records Decision No. 350 (1982).

Finally, we observe that some of the information not excepted from disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code consists of claim file information which is confidential under section 402.083 of the Labor Code.<sup>2</sup> Section 402.083 provides that

---

<sup>2</sup>Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses information made confidential by other statutes.

“[i]nformation in or derived from a claim file regarding an employee is confidential and may not be disclosed by the commission except as provided by this subtitle.” This office has interpreted section 402.083 to protect only that “information in or derived from a claim file that explicitly or implicitly discloses the identities of employees who file workers’ compensation claims.” Open Records Decision No. 619 at 10 (1993). Prior decisions of this office have found that information revealing the date of injury, as well as an injured employee’s name, beneficiary name, commission claim number, social security number, home telephone number, home address, and date of birth implicitly or explicitly identifies claimants and is therefore excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 402.083 of the Labor Code. *Id.* Only in those cases where release of the employer’s identity would reveal the claimant’s identity may the identity of an employer be withheld. Thus, to the extent that the information at issue is claim file information that implicitly or explicitly identifies claimants, it must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 402.083 of the Labor Code.

In summary, with the exception of information that has either been obtained from or provided to the opposing party, the commission may withhold the submitted information under section 552.103 of the Government Code. To the extent that the information at issue is claim file information that implicitly or explicitly identifies claimants, it must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 402.083 of the Labor Code. The remaining submitted information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov’t Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the

governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877)673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512)475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

CN/sdk

Ref: ID# 191443

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Yvonne M. Acosta  
Ray, Valdez, McChristian & Jeans, P.C.  
5822 Cromo Drive  
El Paso, Texas 79912  
(w/o enclosures)